

Packaging Forensics

Package Failure in the Courts

Walter Stern

 TM Lawyers & Judges
Publishing Company, Inc.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1

Introduction	1
1.1 What Is Packaging Forensics?	1
1.2 How to Locate and Retain a Packaging Expert	4
1.3 How to Work with Your Expert	6
1.4 The Expert's Financial Arrangements	8
1.5 Saying "Good Bye" to Your Expert	9
1.6 How This Book Is Organized	9

Chapter 2

Package Failure in the Courts	13
<i>Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.</i>	
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 Typical Package-Failure Cases	14
A. Glass bottles	14
B. Closures	14
C. Labeling	15
D. Dispensing	15
E. Multiwall bags	16
F. Caution notices	16
G. Set-up boxes	16
H. Stapling	17
I. Plastic bottles	18
J. Multipacks	18
K. Corrugated cases	19
2.3 Ways to Minimize the Risk of Lawsuits	19
A. Make packages user-friendly	19
B. Design holding ease, use	20
C. Test full distribution cycles	20
D. Preserve your QC records	21
E. Use independent tests	21
F. Consult a forensic expert	21

Chapter 3

The Packaging Expert	23
<i>Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.</i>	

Chapter 4**Packaging and Product Liability 25***Nancy A. Zettler, Esq.*

4.1 The Trend Toward Lessening the Product Liability Burden on Industry ..	25
A. The trend as it affects packaging	25
B. Warnings	26
4.2 The State of Product Liability Law in the U.S. Today	26
A. Safety packaging	27
B. The Tylenol litigation	27
C. Foreseeability	27
D. Proving foreseeability	28
E. Prior notice of similar misuse	28
F. Feasibility of alternative packaging	30
4.3 Avoiding Litigation	31
A. The manufacturer as expert	31
B. Reliance on industry standards	31
4.4 Conclusion	32
Notes	32

Chapter 5**Using Packaging Experts at Trial In the Post *Daubert* Era 35***Suzelle M. Smith, Esq.*

5.1 Introduction	35
5.2 Infant versus Distributor of Apple Juice	36
5.3 Defendant's Packaging Expert and His Impressive Defense of the Product	36
5.4 Plaintiff Retains an Expert	37
5.5 Defendants Make a <i>Daubert</i> Motion to Preclude Plaintiffs' Expert and Have the Court Thereafter Enter Summary Judgment	38
A. Defendants request a <i>Daubert</i> evidentiary hearing	38
B. Procedure	39
C. Defendant's objections	39
D. Plaintiffs' response	40
E. Hearing	41
F. Ruling	41
5.6 Case Resolution	41

Chapter 6**Product Hazard Communications 43***Charles R. Goerth, Esq. and George A. Peters, J.D., P.E., C.S.P., C.P.E.*

6.1 Introduction	43
------------------------	----

6.2 Space and Location	44
6.3 Space Expansion	45
6.4 Basic Criteria	46
6.5 Conclusion	49
Chapter 7	
Ocular Injuries Caused by Institutional Food Packaging	51
<i>Robert J. Bockserman, C.P.P.</i>	
7.1 Background	51
7.2 The Petition: (Key Paragraphs)	52
7.3 One of the Defendant's Answers (Among Many) to the Petition	53
7.4 Technical Background of Product Information for the Basis of Expert Testimony for the Case	53
7.5 Deposition Data	60
7.6 Searching Technical Literature	68
7.7 Defendant's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment	71
7.8 The Order of the Court on Whether a Partial Summary Judgment Was to be Granted	71
7.9 My Conclusions to This Case	73
References	74
Chapter 8	
Blackburn v. Kitchen Chemical	77
<i>G.E. Campbell, C.P.P.</i>	
8.1 Background and Case	77
8.2 Plaintiff's Claim	77
8.3 Plastic Containers	77
8.4 Testing and Inspection	78
8.5 Conclusion	78
8.6 Discussion	79
Chapter 9	
George v. MasterLab	81
<i>G.E. Campbell, C.P.P.</i>	
9.1 Background and Case	81
9.2 Plaintiff's Claim	81
9.3 Plastic Container	81
9.4 Testing and Inspection	82
9.5 Conclusion	82
9.6 Discussion	82

Chapter 10

The Case of the Careless Nurse	85
<i>ATLA Law Reporter</i>	
10.1 The Case of the Careless Nurse	85
10.2 The Inspiration	86
10.3 Astra's Answer	87
10.4 Settlement Talks	87
10.5 The Trial	88
10.6 Aggravated Circumstances	88
10.7 The Verdict: A Voice That Will Be Heard	89

Chapter 11

When in Doubt, Blame the Box!	91
<i>Jack L. Rosette, Ph.D., C.P.P.</i>	
11.1 Introduction	91
11.2 Complaint from Client	91
11.3 History of Complaint	92
11.4 Components of Packages	92
11.5 Actual versus Potential Losses	92
11.6 Background of ECT versus Mullen	93
11.7 Factors that Contribute to Stacking Strength	94
11.8 Determining Requirements versus Specification	94
11.9 Results of Package Analysis	95
11.10 Examination of Customer Sites	95
11.11 Identification of Contributing Factors	96
11.12 History of Problems in the Corrugated Industry	97
11.13 Contributory Negligence	97
11.14 Tall Box's Response	97
11.15 Miles' Response	98
11.16 Corrective Action	98
11.17 Possible Additional Remedies	99
11.18 Advice to Purchasers of Packaging Materials	99
11.19 Settlement of Case	99
11.20 Summary	99
11.21 Epilogue	100

Chapter 12

The Case of the Burning Man	101
<i>Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.</i>	

Chapter 13**The Case of the Deadly Corrugated Carton 111***Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.*

- 13.1 Background 111
- 13.2 What Happened 111
- 13.3 The Investigation 121

Chapter 14**Packaging Your Case for Success 131***Martin K. Brigham, Esq. and Eunice Trevor, Esq.*

- 14.1 Introduction 131
- 14.2 Prompt Investigation 131
- 14.3 Analyzing Potential Liability 132
 - A. Identifying literature and resources 133
 - B. Identifying expert witnesses 134
- 14.4 Proving Liability 135
- 14.5 Defenses 136
 - A. Compliance with government regulations and industry standards ... 136
 - B. Federal preemption 137
 - C. Cost of remedial measures 137
 - 1. Frequency and severity of accidents 138
 - 2. Cost of safe packaging 138
- 14.6 Conclusion 139

Chapter 15**The Case of the Dangerous Drain Master 141***Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.***Chapter 16****A Shattered Bottle . . . a Shattered Life 155***Francis Patrick Murphy, Esq.*

- 16.1 Introduction 155
- 16.2 Investigation 161
- 16.3 Complaint at Law 162
- 16.4 Discovery 167
- 16.5 Expert Evidence: The Expert 168
- 16.6 The Dailey Case 171
- 16.7 Deposition 172
- 16.8 Negotiations 172
- 16.9 Conclusion 172

Chapter 17**The Case of the Stress Cracked Plastic Bottles: "B" v. "C" Company 175***G.E. Campbell, C.P.P.*

17.1 Background and Case	175
17.2 Plaintiff's Claim	175
17.3 Plastic Containers	175
17.4 Testing and Inspection	176
17.5 Conclusion	176
17.6 Discussion	176

Chapter 18**Santos v. Automotive Chemical 183***G.E. Campbell, C.P.P.*

18.1 Background and Case	183
18.2 Plaintiff's Claim	183
18.3 Plastic Container	183
18.4 Testing and Inspection	184
18.5 Conclusion	184
18.6 Discussion	184

Chapter 19**The Spray Paint Can That Burned Down a House 187***Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.***Chapter 20****The Packaging Expert in Litigation 191***Patrick E. Carr, Esq.***Chapter 21****The Case of the Torn Beverage Carrier 203***Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.*

21.1 Introduction	203
21.2 The Accident	205
21.3 General Comments on Beverage Carriers for Soft Drinks	205
21.4 Examination of the Bottle Carrier in Suit	208
21.5 Conclusions	217

Chapter 22**A Billion Dollar Quality Control Problem 219***Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.*

Chapter 23**Distribution Packaging 223***Barry S. Rope*

23.1 Case 1: Pallets of Commercial Bags	223
23.2 Case 2: Construction Windows	224
23.3 Case 3: Palletized Sheet Steel	226
23.4 Case 4: Bags of Industrial Powder	230

Chapter 24**Single Parcel Shipments by Ground and Air Carriers 233***Paul Singh, Ph.D.*

24.1 Introduction	233
24.2 Parcel Shipping Environment	233
A. Shipping orientation and drop heights	234
B. Use of fragile and pictorial labels	235
C. Use of shock-sensitive labels	235
24.3 Role of Pre-Shipment Testing	235
24.4 Package Functions	237
24.5 Distribution Packaging Test Methods for Parcel Shipments	238
24.6 Pictorial Markings	240
24.7 Precautionary Labeling	240
24.8 Conclusions	241
References	241

Chapter 25**Transport Packaging for Glass Table Tops 243***Alfred H. McKinlay, P.E., C.P.-P/M.H.*

25.1 Overview of the Case	243
A. Summary of events leading to litigation	243
B. Expert witness retained	243
25.2 The Investigation	244
A. Initial information	244
B. Packaging regulations	244
C. National Motor Freight Classification	244
D. Photos and freight bills	245
E. Expert's conclusions	245
25.3 Interrogatories to the Expert	246
25.4 The Expert's Deposition	247
25.5 Conclusion of the Case	247
25.6 Observations Concerning the Case	248
References	248

Chapter 26

Case of Refused Payment for Product Delivery 249

Peter Henningsen, Jr., C.P.P.

- 26.1 Introduction 249
- 26.2 Selecting Expert Witnesses 249
- 26.3 Case in Description 250
- 26.4 Initial Meeting with Law Firm Principal 251
 - A. Establishing confidence between expert witness and attorneys 251
 - B. Definition of actions to be taken 251
- 26.5 Investigation Procedures 251
 - A. Product characteristics and packaging requirements 251
 - B. Handling requirements for bagged product 252
 - C. Pallets and palletizing considerations 252
 - D. Observation of defendant’s pallet receiving and handling operations 253
 - E. On-site observation of plaintiff’s packaging operations 254
- 26.6 Data Collection Requirements 255
 - A. Identifying needed records 255
 - B. Review of plaintiff’s production and shipment records 255
 - C. Review of defendant’s purchase records 256
- 26.7 Submission of reports 256
- 26.8 Conclusions 257

Chapter 27

The Case of the Blinding Staples 259

Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.

Chapter 28

The Role of the Expert Witness 271

Grantges J. Raymus, M.E., M.S., P.E.

- 28.1 Qualifications 271
- 28.2 Serving the Needs of a Trial Attorney 271
- 28.3 Serving the Needs of the Court 272
- 28.4 Some Typical Cases 273
 - A. Personal injury resulted from use of a hazardous material although package used complied with DOT regulations. 273
 - B. A wrong plastic gasket in a steel drum resulted in the spill of a regulated solvent. 273
 - C. Plaintiff was injured by a flash fire while a solvent was being used by another workman. 274

D. An improperly-made can resulted in considerable loss of a new product to a major manufacturer of consumer goods.	275
28.5 Conclusion	275

Chapter 29

Packaging Machinery Litigation Cases	277
<i>Robert A. Luciano, P.E., C.P.P.</i>	
29.1 Machine-Related Operator Inquiry	277
29.2 Description of the Case	278
29.3 Initial Attorney/Expert Contact	281
29.4 Inspection of the Accident Scene and the Equipment Involved	282
29.5 Final Report	282

Chapter 30

The Case of the Defectively Packaged Pie Server	295
<i>Matthew W. Loughren, Esq.</i>	
30.1 Accident Facts	295
30.2 The Product	295
30.3 General Theories of Liability	296
30.4 Expert Witnesses	296
30.5 Conclusion	296

Chapter 31

The Case of the Exploding Bottle Cap	297
<i>Walter Stern, C.P.P., A.C.F.E.</i>	

About the Author	301
About the Contributors	303
Index	313